UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF RHODE ISLAND

GERALD M. CARBONE,

Plaintiff

:

VS.

C.A. NO.: 10-194S

THE STATE OF RHODE ISLAND; and : SARA R. STRACHAN, in her Official Capacity :

as Administrator of Motor Vehicles

Defendants

CONSENT JUDGMENT

WHEREAS, the Plaintiff, Gerald M. Carbone ("Plaintiff" or "Carbone"), has filed the above-captioned civil action in the United States District Court for the District of Rhode Island, alleging causes of action pursuant to the Fifth and Fourteenth Amendments of the U.S. Constitution and Article I, Section 2 of the R.I. Constitution; and

WHEREAS, the Defendants, the State of Rhode Island, and Sara R. Strachan, in her official capacity as Administrator of the Division of Motor Vehicles (the "State" or the "Defendants"), deny any and all said allegations of violation of law and are defending this civil action; and

WHEREAS, the parties agree that it is in the best interests of all parties to settle this civil action; and

NOW, THEREFORE, the parties to this civil action, by and through the undersigned attorneys of record, stipulate and agree to the following:

1. Defendant, DMV, issued a Revised Notice of Action license suspension to Plaintiff, Carbone, on April 30, 2010, a copy of which is attached hereto as Exhibit A. Plaintiff, Carbone, may avail himself to any and all of his legal rights to a hearing pursuant to said Revised Notice of Action.

- 2. Defendant, DMV, sent letters to the approximately 1,621 individuals who previously received a so-called Code 31 Notice of Action license suspension from the DMV during the period of December 1, 2009, through June 4, 2010, and in connection with the DMV's data cleansing initiative. Said letters advised these individuals of the DMV's offer to provide additional information concerning the circumstances surrounding their license suspension and offered them the right to a hearing concerning these matters.
- 3. Defendant, DMV, agrees that beginning August 4, 2010, all license suspension Notices of Action that were issued have contained and, hereinafter, all such notices to be issued shall contain language as to a "Right To A Hearing" (attached hereto as Exhibit B) and "Hearing Procedures" (attached hereto as Exhibit C). The "Right to a Hearing" language shall appear on the face of the Notice of Action, and the "Hearing Procedures" language shall appear on the reverse side of the Notice of Action.
- 4. Defendant, DMV, agrees that, upon receipt of any Request for Hearing, it will immediately stay any such suspension until such time as the hearing decision has been rendered.
- 5. The parties recognize that the impetus for many such Notices of Action come from courts and/or agencies other than the DMV itself. Defendant, DMV, agrees that upon receipt of a request for hearing, it will forward the request to the court or agency that caused the particular Notice of Action to be sent so that the adjudication of that request for hearing will occur in that court or agency.
- 6. Defendant, DMV, agrees that it will maintain the stay until that court or agency reports back to the DMV with a decision/adjudication on the request for hearing.
- 7. In the event that the impetus for the issuance of the Notice of Action was the DMV itself, the DMV agrees to issue a stay upon receipt of a request for hearing, and agrees to adjudicate the hearing in accordance within the statutory parameters set forth in §31-11-7 and outlined in Exhibit B.
- 8. Defendant, DMV, agrees that no later than 2011, its upgraded computer system, RIMS, will produce Notices of Action that comply with Paragraphs two (2) and three (3) above.
- 9. Defendant, DMV, agrees to pay a counsel fee of \$12,300.00 (\$11,800.00 for legal fees and \$500.00 for costs) to James E. Kelleher, Esq.

Approved By:		
Judge William E. Smith	e District of Rhode	Island

Presented by:

James E. Kelleher, Esq., Bar No. 4054

Rhode Island Affiliate, ACLU

Dated: September _____, 2010.

946 Centerville Road

Warwick, RI 02886

TEL: (401) 822-2900

FAX: (401) 826-3245

jamesk@rrsplaw.com

Thomas A. Palombo, Bar No. 4212

Assistant Attorney General

150 South Main Street

Providence, RI 02903

TEL: (401) 274-4400, Ext. 2296

FAX: (401) 222-2995

tpalombo@riag.ri.gov

3



101462083

STATE OF RHODE ISLAND AND PROVIDENCE PLANTATIONS DIVISION OF MOTOR VEHICLES REVISED NOTICE OF ACTION

0000-000

4/30/2010 ORDER DATE 5/01/2010 SUSPENSION DATE BFFECTIVE TIME m.q ec:11 9/03/1958 DATE OF BIRTH XXX-XX:0594 SOC, SEC. #

GERALD M. CARBONE 21 BALCOM AVE. WARWICK, RI 02889

REE DUE:

\$70.00

FOR THE REASON(S) SHOWN BELOW, YOU ARE HEREBY NOTIFIED OF THE FOLLOWING ACTION(S) IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE STATUTORY PROVISIONS OF THE MOTOR VEHICLE LAWS.

ACTION(S): SUSPENSION LICENSE/REGISTRATION(S)/VINS(S)	PERIOD	REASON FOR ACTION	DATE OF INCIDENT	SUMMONS NO. . CASE NO. VOUCEER NO.	
IICENSE! KESET RELATION	OF TIME_		11/27/1989	F11721	
9012451	IND.	04 FAIL TO APPEAR/PAY SPEED VIO.			

IMPORTANT INFORMATION - PLEASE READ ANY LICENSE, ID, PERMIT, REGISTRATION(S) AND PLATE(S) WHICH IS/ARE WITHDRAWN MUST RETURNED BY THE SUSPENSION DATE AS NOTED ABOVE. PAILURE TO DELIVER A LICENSE OR REGISTRATION CERTIFICATION AND PLATES TO DIVISION OF MOTOR VEHICLES, OPERATOR CONTROL 30 HOWARD AVE., BLDG. 58, LOWER LV., CRANSTON, RI 02920 WILL RESULT IN CONTINUED SUSPENSION AND/OR A FINE OF \$500.00

You Will Receive No Further Notice Of This Suspension A mandatory fee must be paid in order to have your license or operating privilege reinstated by the Division of Motor Vehicles.

REFER INQUIRIES TO:

DIVISION OF MOTOR VEHICLES OPERATOR CONTROL 30 HOWARD AVE., BLDG. 58, LOWER LV. CRANSTON, RI 02920 (401) 462-0800

RIGHT TO A HEARING:

You have the right to a hearing by calling Operator Control at (401) 462-0800 wifnin ten (10) days of the Order date. By requesting a hearing, no further action to suspend your license will be taken unfil a hearing has been held and a decision issued. Hearing procedures are on the reverse side of this Notice of Action.

"PRRIOD OF TIME" INDICATES MINIMUM SUSPENSION PERIOD

* HINANCIAL RESPONSIBILITY MESSAGE

THE ACTIONS LISTED ARE REFERRITVE FOR THE TIMES INDICATED AND THEREAFTER UNTIL YOU'RE PROOF OF BINANCIAL RESPONSED LITY FOR THE FUTURE; AND YOU ARE FURTHER NOTIFIED THAT THE ABOVE NUMBERED REGISTRATION(S), AND ALL OTHER REGISTRATIONS IN YOUR NAME AS OWNER, ARE ALSO SUSPENDED AS OF THE EFFECTIVE DATE UNTIL PROOF OF FINANCIAL RESPONSIBILITY FOR THE FUTURE IS GIVEN FOR SUCH VEHICLE(S). YOU MUST CONTACT YOUR INSURANCE CARRIER TO ARRANGE FOR AN ER-22 CERTIFICATE FILING (PROOF OF FINANCIAL RESPONSIBILITY FOR THE FUTURE).

SARA R. STRACHAN ADMINISTRATOR DIVISION OF MOTOR VEHICLES

2010/APR/30/FR1 03:40 OPERATION CONTINUI

HEARING PROCEDURES

In accordance with Rhode Island General Laws 31-11-7 (d) thru (f), the Division of Miotor Vehicles ("DMV") shall ensure that the hearing procedures provide for the following:

- (1) an opportunity for an in person hearing before a fair and impartial decision-
- (2) the opportunity to produce relevant documents and witnesses;
- (3) the opportunity to ask questions of and otherwise confront and cross-examine
- (4) access to all of the evidence upon which the DMV relied in making its suspension decision by calling the Inquiries phone number on the front of this Notice of
- (5) the right to present any and all relevant and admissible evidence.

During the hearing, the DMV shall bear the burden of proof as to the existence of the grounds for the suspension. The DMV may also administer oaths and may issue subpoenas for the attendance of witnesses and the production of relevant records, books and papers.

After the hearing, the DMV shall issue a written decision based solely on the hearing evidence and containing the legal and facture basis for the decision. The DMV may either decide against the license suspension, determining that the suspension is not warranted; may continue, modify, or extend the suspension; or may revoke or suspend the license.



RIGHT TO A HEARING

You may have the right to schedule a hearing by sending a written request for a hearing to DMV Operator Control within ten days of the Order date. By requesting a hearing, no further action to suspend your license will be taken until a hearing has been held and a decision issued. Hearing Procedures are on the reverse side of this Notice of Action.

"EXHIBIT C"

HEARING PROCEDURES

In accordance with Rhode Island General Laws 31-11-7 (d) thru (f), the Division of Motor Vehicles ("DMV") shall ensure that the hearing procedures provide for the following:

(1) an opportunity for an in person hearing before a fair and impartial decision-maker;

(2) the opportunity to produce relevant documents and witnesses;

- (3) the opportunity to ask questions of and otherwise confront and cross-examine witnesses;
- (4) access to all of the evidence upon which the DMV relied in making its suspension decision by calling the Inquiries phone number on the front of this Notice of Action; and
- (5) the right to present any and all relevant and admissible evidence.

During the hearing, the DMV shall bear the burden of proof as to the existence of the grounds for the suspension. The DMV may also administer oaths and may issue subpoenas for the attendance of witnesses and the production of relevant records, books and papers.

After the hearing, the DMV shall issue a written decision based solely on the hearing evidence and containing the legal and factual basis for the decision. The DMV may either decide against the license suspension, determining that the suspension is not warranted; may continue, modify, or extend the suspension; or may revoke or suspend the license.

* * *

You may not be entitled to a preliminary hearing prior to license suspension pursuant to Rhode Island General Laws 3 1-11-7(a) upon a showing that you have been adjudicated by a court to have:

- (1) committed an offense for which mandatory license revocation or suspension is required upon conviction or adjudication;
- (2) committed offenses against traffic regulations governing the movement of vehicles with such frequency as to indicate a disrespect for the traffic laws and a disregard for the safety of others on the highways;
- (3) been a reckless or negligent driver of a motor vehicle, or permitted an unlawful or fraudulent use of a license;
- (4) committed an offense in another state which, if committed in this state, would be grounds for suspension or revocation; and/or
- (5) committed any offense enumerated by 3 1-9-1 of the Rhode Island General Laws;

You may also not be entitled to such a preliminary hearing prior to license suspension if you are the subject of an order pursuant to 14-1-67 of the Rhode Island General Laws, following a court's finding that a minor is delinquent or wayward, and/or if you pose an imminent safety risk to the general public as determined by the application of reasonable standards.